

**MINUTES OF THE
REGULAR MEETING OF THE COMMON
COUNCIL OF THE TOWN OF STAR VALLEY**

**Tuesday, March 6, 2018 at 6:00 pm
3675 East Highway 260, Star Valley, AZ
(Star Valley Town Hall)**

The Agenda for the meeting is as follows:

- PRAYER was offered by Rev. Linda Westcott of Community Presbyterian Church.
- PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE
- CALL TO ORDER

- **ROLL CALL:**

Mayor McDaniel X , Vice Mayor O'Connor X , Council Member Coon X , Council Member McKinney X , Council Member Davis X , Council Member Stephenson X , Council Member Armington X .

- **CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS:**

All items listed under the Consent Agenda will be voted on with one motion. If discussion is desired regarding any Consent Agenda item, that item will be removed from the Consent Agenda and voted on separately.

A. Approval of the minutes from the Regular Council Meeting held on February 20, 2018 and the Work Study Meeting held on February 13, 2018.

B. Approval of Claims Payable from February 16, 2018 through February 28, 2018 for the General Fund and for the Water Department.

A motion to approve consent agenda items A and B was made by Council Member Coon and was seconded by Council Member Davis.

A roll call vote was taken:

Mayor McDaniel X , Vice Mayor O'Connor X , Council Member Coon X , Council Member McKinney X , Council Member Davis X , Council Member Stephenson X , Council Member Armington X .

The motion was voted on and passed 7 - 0.

- **DISCUSSION ITEMS:**

- 1. Update on the Community Garden. Presentation by Community Garden Committee Members Glen McCombs, Chairman and Marion Grill, Director.**

Chairman Glen McCombs stated there is excitement in the air about the Community Garden and that so far, they are right on budget. Mr. McCombs briefly went through the expense report (attached). The committee, explained Mr. McCombs, decided to go with chain link rather than cyclone fencing, which put them a few thousand over budget. The treated garden borders were changed to untreated, saving quite a bit of money, and the irrigation is right on budget. Mr. McCombs reported the plans are to open by the end of March or early April. Pointed out Mr. McCombs – critter proofing came in a little cheaper, the shed was purchased from Home Depot, but there will be a cost over-run as they did not budget in the foundation. Lastly, reported Mr. McCombs, they revised the garden plot fees – the larger plots are \$65.00, and the smaller plots are \$55 – giving an annual income of \$3,750.00. Council Member Davis thanked the volunteers for the hours they have put in and asked how long the untreated wood would last. Mr. McCombs responded it should last seven to ten years and maintenance has been added to the budget to replace the wood as it deteriorates.

Director Marion Grill briefly went over the progress report (attached) stating that ¼ of the beds are complete with the bunny fence being installed next week. They are on track, reported Ms. Grill, and lined up next will be key pad install for the entry gate and coordination of top soil and compost delivery. Ms. Grill reported she will make the public aware of when community garden registration is open in a press release posted on the Town website, as well as informing the radio stations and news media. Reported Ms. Grill, four wheel-barrows have been donated and secured, and other items they will be securing prior to opening are a dumpster and porta-toilet. Orientation and gardening classes will be coordinated promptly after open registration, stated Ms. Grill. The storage shed will be assembled after the garden opens, as the concrete foundation for the shed is needed and was not provided for in the budget. After opening, reported Ms. Grill, volunteers will be coordinated to help install electric to the shed; beautification and planting of the four fruit trees will take place; and a concrete apron for the gate will need to be installed, which was not provided for in the budget.

Council Member Stephenson asked if a ribbon cutting or dedication will take place. Mr. McCombs recalled Mr. Grier and staff would be coordinating a ground-breaking ceremony. Council Member Stephenson asked if community garden information is located on the Town website. Finance Administrator Nutt explained the Town website has a drop-down section for the Community Garden which includes the updates, Usage Agreement and Garden Plot layout. Mayor McDaniel stated Council is excited about this project.

- 2. Discussion regarding playground system and safety surface options for the B. Diane McDaniel Community Park presented by Town Clerk Chapin.**

Town Clerk Chapin thanked Council for the opportunity to present playground and safety surface options to them. Explained Ms. Chapin, she began researching playground equipment prior to applying for the 2017 tribal grants and was recently directed to obtain bids from three companies. She is providing playground options from three playground manufacturers along with information on lower cost safety surfacing options and will be in receipt of bids shortly. The Town is restricted to the playground space dimensions of 55ft in length by 31 feet in width, reported Ms. Chapin, and the goal would be to

accommodate children ages 2 through 12. Ms. Chapin went through the playground systems (see attached) from GameTime, Playground Depot and Playworld.

Ms. Chapin then explained to Council the importance of creating a safe play space by selecting the right playground surface and that surfacing products are engineered to work with the play systems and are matched to the specifications required for adequate safety surfacing, including the correct calculation of play equipment fall heights. Starting with the most cost-effective option, reported Ms. Chapin, engineered wood fiber is a traditional playground surfacing option because of its excellent shock-absorbing properties when maintained and installed at appropriate depths. It requires on-going maintenance and occasional topping off during its lifetime due to compaction and decomposition. Once the engineered wood fiber has settled it forms a knitted layer that is designed to support a variety of mobility devices including wheelchairs, crutches, and walkers. Another cost-effective option, reported Ms. Chapin, would be a combination of engineered wood fiber and pour-in-place surfacing. The pour-in-place surfacing would be located at the bottom of slide exits or under swings to avoid kick-out. The maintenance is considerably less than loose fill materials and they are very easy to walk or roll over, making them a great solution for accessible playgrounds. With both options a playground border is necessary to reduce the spread of surfacing to non-play areas, explained Ms. Chapin,

Council Member Davis asked if the playground equipment is in the budget. Town Manager Grier responded the monies would come out of the General Fund. It would be a good project and the Town can afford it, stated Mr. Grier. Council Member Coon pointed out the present playground equipment won't last much longer. Mr. Grier stated it needs to be replaced with commercial grade equipment. Council Member Stephenson advocated that critical to that is the surface, which must be safe – and hopes the Town Attorney will take a close look at the surface and the liability of the Town to provide an adequate surface. Mayor McDaniel asked Town Manager Grier if he is looking for a dollar amount that they all agree upon. Mr. Grier answered he would like a ballpark figure to narrow the scope of options. Council Member McKinney stated there are numerous projects at the park and they don't need to be done all at once, questioning the possibility of deferring the pickle ball court.

Council Member Armington stated he is concerned about the durability and longevity of the equipment. Mr. Grier responded the playground equipment is commercial grade – more bomb proof – conceding it's a given that kids will be tough on the equipment. Vice Mayor O'Connor stated he is the softy of the bunch and likes the \$140,000.00 idea. "How much is a smile worth?" questioned Vice Mayor O'Connor. Council Member McKinney suggested a \$40,000.00 cap for playground equipment. Council Member Stephenson suggested upward of \$40,000.00 to provide a good surface for the playground. Council Member Davis pointed out safety surfacing is critical. Mayor McDaniel asked Council if they agree to a \$50,000.00 limit – Council agreed.

3. Discussion and possible action regarding the direction of the Rim Country Trails Planning Committee.

This was originally Discussion Item #4 and was moved up by Mayor McDaniel at the request of Vice Mayor O'Connor. Town Manager Grier stated Vice Mayor O'Connor is concerned that the trails committee is going in a different direction than what the community has in mind. Mayor McDaniel stated in his opinion we don't need to sacrifice anything as far as off-road vehicles are concerned and that he supports the off-road vehicle situation. Vice Mayor O'Connor stated residents want to keep things the way they are, which he agrees with, acknowledging that change is inevitable. Residents complained to him they were not aware of the meetings and he feels they should not be punished for not knowing about or going to the meetings. Vice Mayor O'Connor stated he noticed the big push is for hiking and biking – pointing out this is a hunting and fishing mecca with the main draw being motorized. Hearing that the

NEPA study was not going to be done threw up a red flag for him. Advocated Vice Mayor O'Connor, the trail committee members need to interject and represent what residents from Star Valley want. Vice Mayor O'Connor then asked if any of the trail committee members could give an update. Council Member Davis reported the rim country trails planning group has been meeting for about 1 ½ years to come up with ways to improve the rim country trail systems by providing connection access. Council Member Davis read a statement from the U.S. Forest Service Supervisors Office that the Tonto National Forest is an OHV forest and that they are just trying to manage the impact. Reported Council Member Davis, there is 3,600 miles of motorized roads and trails – the forest service is trying to control cross country traveling to avoid the creation of trails by motorized vehicles - asking hunters, big gamers and firewood gatherers to limit the off-road use and go no further than one mile.

Council Member Davis stated everyone is invited to attend the meetings to put in their two cents worth, pointing out the meetings have been advertised in the Roundup, on the radio, on Facebook, and on the rimcountrytrails.net website. The forest service wants the input, reported Council Member Davis. Vice Mayor O'Connor stated it appeared this was being organized for hiking and biking trails only. Council Member Davis responded all different groups – off-roaders, hikers, mountain bikers - are involved. Council Member Stephenson stated he attended a meeting and carefully addressed the Star Valley position in terms of the trail heads because the Council has not taken a position on motorized or non-motorized. He was very careful not to take a side one-way or the other, disclosed Council Member Stephenson. Mayor McDaniel stated he supports all the groups. Council Member Stephenson made an analogy that the national forest is akin to the community park in that there are different areas set aside for different uses – they are trying to respect the multiple uses that are out there. Council Member Stephenson recommended an option of adopting a resolution in support of the Tonto National Forest Travel Management Plan in favor of maximizing off-road use. Mayor McDaniel stated he supports the idea of a Council vote. Council Member Coon stated there should be room for everyone with 3600 miles of trails. If this splits in to motorized vs. non-motorized, disclosed Council Member Coon, nothing will happen and this whole thing will go away.

Mayor McDaniel opened this portion of the meeting up for public comments. Gary Chitwood of 272 W. Chitwood Trail stated he works for Arctic Cat as the sales manager. Mr. Chitwood feels the trails planning meetings have been kept quiet and he is concerned this will be rubber stamped and pushed through. It will put him out of business, reported Mr. Chitwood. George Binney of 197 Valley Road recommended that Council use the engineered wood fiber for playground safety surfacing. Commented Mr. Binney, the forest service is restricting everything down and controlling more and more. Earl Chitwood of 350 N. Chitwood Lane stated he has been riding the trails for forty years and is of the opinion the Forest Service plans to shut them down, one way or another. There are less trails now than there were forty years ago, stated Mr. Chitwood, and he doesn't believe the forest service is honest about things. Mayor McDaniel suggested Council put this to a vote. Council Member Davis explained the idea behind these open meetings is for concerned citizens to voice their opinions. No one has said they want to shut down the trails to off-road vehicles, stated Council Member Davis.

A motion that the Town of Star Valley supports the use of off-road motorized vehicles in the Tonto Forest was made by Council Member McKinney and was seconded by Vice Mayor O'Connor.

Council Member Coon stated he is not in favor of the motion, clarifying he is in favor of motorized vehicles, and anyone concerned should attend the trails meeting with an open mind. Vice Mayor O'Connor stated he is in support of all the groups equally and recommends the committee members of Star Valley support the groups equally. Council Member Davis questioned if there is some belief the committee is not. Vice Mayor O'Connor responded the no NEPA study is the red flag – an indication to him of the elimination of motorized travel. Council Member Stephenson disclosed he

cannot support the motion as it is too broad for him. Explained Council Member Stephenson, the trails committee is involved in the planning effort by the Forest Service, not the travel management plan. Council Member McKinney spoke to his motion – as a 71 year-old taxpayer and citizen, these forests belong to him as well as the 19 year-old mountain biker. If he is going to have the ability to utilize the forest a motorized vehicle is a necessity. The only mode of enjoying the forest that is under pressure is the motorized vehicles, hence his motion, explained Council Member McKinney. Vice Mayor O'Connor stated he disagrees with the motion because of the broadness and would like the Star Valley Council representatives to speak equally of all groups at the meetings. Council Member Davis acknowledged no one can be left out and all groups should be supported. Council Member McKinney pointed out there is nothing in the motion that excludes any other form of access, reiterating the only form of access under pressure is the motorized access. Discussion followed concerning the trails committee. Mayor McDaniel stated it is proper to follow the guideline to support the constituents on this issue. Vice Mayor O'Connor stated he would like Star Valley committee representatives the authorization to speak on behalf of the Town.

A roll call vote was taken:

Mayor McDaniel Yes, Vice Mayor O'Connor Yes, Council Member Coon Yes, Council Member McKinney Yes, Council Member Davis Yes, Council Member Stephenson No, Council Member Armington Yes.

The motion was voted on and passed 6 - 1.

4. Discussion and possible action regarding the cost to create pickle ball courts and a drinking fountain for the community park.

This was originally Discussion Item #3 and was moved to #4 by Mayor McDaniel. Town Manager Grier reported Council had requested staff to research the cost of pickle ball courts and drinking fountains – pointing out the prices are included in the council packet. Mr. Grier informed Council he visited the pickle ball courts in Payson – they were being used and there was a line of people waiting to play. The Town of Payson has two pickle ball courts, reported Mr. Grier, which are all the craze according to Town Manager LaRon Garrett. Mr. Grier recommended going with the heavy gauge 6-foot chain link fence and reported the total estimated expense would be \$19,307.00.

The drinking fountain options range in price and are tabbed in the council handout, pointed out Mr. Grier. The ballpark estimate for the labor to plumb in to the bathroom going through the wall would be \$600.00 to \$800.00. Mr. Grier stated he believes park usage would increase with the addition of a pickle ball court along with playground equipment, and that the Town can afford this project using money from the General Fund. It's time to completely develop and invest in the park, advocated Mr. Grier. Mayor McDaniel stated he likes the idea of a pickle ball court and that the drinking fountain is a must have for the park. Council Member Armington asked if the proposal is to eliminate the volleyball court. The volleyball court would be out, responded Mr. Grier.

A motion to approve the installation of a pickle ball court at a cost of \$25,000.00 and a drinking fountain at a cost of up to \$300.00 for the community park was made by Council Member Davis.

Vice Mayor O'Connor questioned if approval means the playground equipment will be eliminated. Town Manager Grier answered that both projects are being proposed. Mr. Grier commented on the motion made and pointed out the installation of the fountain would be \$600.00 to \$800.00, questioning if Council Member Davis is proposing \$300 for the fountain itself. Discussion followed concerning the motion and cost of the drinking fountain. Town Manager Grier requested separate motions for the pickle ball and drinking fountain. Council Member Davis withdrew his previous motion.

A motion to approve the installation of a pickle ball court at a cost of up to \$25,000.00 was made by Council Member Davis and was seconded by Vice Mayor O'Connor. The motion was voted on and passed 7 – 0.

Council Member Armington stated the biggest concern is our weather and questioned if the drinking fountain options are safe for frost. The drinking fountain would be installed between the doors of the two heated bathrooms where the enclosed plumbing already exists and would be safe against the elements, answered Mr. Grier. Council Member Armington asked if a comment could be taken from George Binney. Mr. Binney reported the drinking fountain would have to be shut off in the winter. It could be opened every morning, explained Mr. Binney, but would need to be drained down every night to keep the pipe from bursting. Town Manager Grier clarified Finance Administrator Nutt has done the diligent research on the drinking fountains. Council Member Davis asked Finance Administrator Nutt if she had a preference. Ms. Nutt responded it depends on what Council would like to spend, suggesting the purchase of an ADA compliant drinking fountain. Stated Ms. Nut, it is not necessary to purchase a frost resistant drinking fountain if no one minds it being turned off in the colder months of the year.

A motion to authorize the Town Manager and staff to pursue the purchase and installation of an ADA compliant drinking fountain for the park was made by Council Member Stephenson and was seconded by Council Member McKinney. The motion was voted on and passed 7 – 0.

- **COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC**

During this portion of the meeting, members of the public may address the Town Council on items that are not on the printed agenda. Any remarks shall be addressed to the Council as a whole and not to any individual member. Speakers are limited to three (3) minutes per person unless additional time is granted by the Mayor. The Council may not discuss or act upon matters raised during public comments.

The Mayor opened this portion of the meeting up for public comments.

There were no comments and the Mayor closed this portion of the meeting.

- **ADJOURNMENT**

A motion to adjourn the meeting was made by Council Member Davis and was seconded by Vice Mayor O'Connor. The motion was voted on and passed 7 – 0.

APPROVED:

Ronnie O. McDaniel, Mayor

Date: _____

ATTEST:

Edie Chapin, Town Clerk

CERTIFICATION:

I hereby certify that the foregoing minutes are a true and correct copy of the minutes of the regular meeting of the Town Council of the Town of Star Valley held on the 6th day of March 2018. I further certify that the meeting was duly called and held, and that a quorum was present.

Dated this 8th day of March 2018.

Edie Chapin, Town Clerk